WHO HIA Sub-network Training Report

Introduction

As part of the delivery of the WHO HIA Sub network action plan, Health Impact Assessment training was held in Paris (14-16 November 2005). This consisted of:
- 1 day training for "train the trainers" (14 Nov)
- 2 day training for beginners (15-16 Nov)

The list of delegates attending the train the trainers and beginners programme can be seen in Appendix 1. The agenda for both programmes are outlined in Appendix 2 and 3.

Erica Ison (independent consultant to WHO) led the training. Claire Higgins (Institute of Public Health, Ireland) chaired the Training for Trainers day and Ruth Fleming (Belfast Healthy Cities) chaired the Training for Beginners two day event.

Evaluation

Following the training all participants form both training events were emailed an evaluation form.

Summary of the "Train the Trainer" Programme Evaluation Results

11 people participated in the 'Train the Trainers' day representing 7 cities. 9 participants (6 cities – Bologna, Brighton & Hove, Bursa, Geneva, Helsingborg and Turku) returned their evaluation forms (see Appendix 4 for full results of evaluation). Participants were asked to score how useful they found the presentations and workshops **(5 – very useful; 1 – not at all useful)**. They were also asked questions concerning their level of understanding of HIA before and after the training; their level of confidence in training others on HIA and supporting others to complete a HIA in the future; additional support they required; what they learnt from the programme; future training needs and finally overall comments on the programme.

Presentations

Four presentations were given by Erica Ison at the beginning of this day.   Evaluation forms showed that 8 out of 9 respondents gave a scoring of 4 or 5 for all four of the presentations. The first presentation appeared to give the most positive response with 4 out of 9 respondents giving a scoring of 5. No respondents scored these presentations less than 3.

Workshops

During the 'Train the Trainers' programme participants were asked to take part in four workshops. Again the response was very positive in relation to the usefulness placed on these workshops with the vast majority scoring either 4 (5 – 8 respondents) or 5 (1 – 3 respondents).

Handouts

Eight handouts were sent electronically to participants prior to the training. The majority of people felt these handouts were very useful scoring 4 or above (7 out of 9 respondents). The handout on facilitation skills scored the highest in terms of usefulness.

Training experience and level of understanding of HIA
6 out of 9 respondents had no experience of HIA training or helping to train people in HIA before coming on this course. 5 of the 9 respondents felt that as a result of the training they felt more confident about training people in HIA.

In relation to participants level of understanding of HIA prior to the training, participants either gave themselves a score of 3 (5 respondents) or 4 (4 respondents). The training had raised their level of understanding of HIA – this was reflected in the scoring where participants gave themselves a score of 4 (5 respondents) and 5 (4 respondents - high level of understanding).

Support and training needs
A few participants still felt they would need additional support to complete a HIA. This additional support included:
- providing an advanced 'train the trainers' programme
- specific training for the appraisal stage
- having someone to contact to provide advice when they meet difficulties
- help with evaluating a draft HIA report.

Learning points
There were a wide range of learning points identified by participants, too many to mention in this summary document. A few examples of learning points included:
- an improvement in presentation skills
- help with supporting people through HIA
- writing HIA reports
- learnt some important methodological issues regarding the HIA process
- enhanced skills to work with politicians and engage them in the process throughout.

Overall comments
Overall comments on the day were very positive, many of them praising the skill of the trainer. Some people commented that they would have preferred to have papers/ documentation sent to them more in advance (10-15 days prior).

Summary of the "Beginners" Programme Evaluation Results
23 people participated in the 'Training for Beginners'. Unfortunately only 10 participants representing 6 cities - Liege, Copenhagen, Seixal, Bologna, Bursa, Geneva and Turku - returned their evaluation forms. Some of these were joint responses from a city, e.g. Liege sent in one response on behalf of the three people. (see Appendix 5 for full results of evaluation). In the evaluation forms, participants were asked to score how useful they found the presentations and workshops **(5 – very useful; 1 – not at all useful)**.

Presentations and workshops
Over the two-day beginners training, the trainer, Erica Ison gave 8 presentations in all. 8 out of the 10 respondents felt that these presentations were useful or very useful (scores of 4 and 5 out of 5).

Scoring for the workshop exercises was more varied – the majority of participants still scored these highly with an average score of 4 out of 5. The workshops which scored the highest were: Working with politicians and monitoring and evaluation. The rapid appraisal workshop was also seen as useful.

Level of understanding of HIA
Participants level of understanding of HIA was raised as a result of the training – 6 of the 10 respondents scoring their level of understanding at 4 out of 5, compared to 3 out of 10 giving the same score prior to the training. Unfortunately 4 of the 10 respondents still did not feel confident about undertaking a HIA in the future.

Support needed
Participants were asked what support they would need to help them carry out a HIA. Responses to this question are outlined below.

- "We feel we would need guidance from experienced people who have already conducted small scale HIA"
- Someone available to help evaluate draft HIA reports and be available to answer questions on HIA when difficulties arise
- Support in being a facilitator during the process of doing an HIA
- Examples of standard documents: methodology document, scoping document etc
- A HIA database to facilitate (when looking for quick information) the execution of a HIA. The current HIA database available (i.e. HIA Gateway) simply listed the completed HIA reports. A more useful database should organise the information in order to allow cross search through items, key words etc
- Support with teaching people how to do a HIA and why, i.e. advantages versus difficulties and how to manage the difficulties
- Support from management and from partners involved, plus enough time to do the job

Training needs
Training needs listed by participants included:
- Training organised in French
- It would be useful if we could have a personal trainer/guide: someone we could contact regularly when we have questions and who could advise us on the different steps to take to run the HIA
- More case studies/examples within the exercises used during the training. Ideas/ methods on how to facilitate an HIA especially appraisal
- Focus on a more extensive exercise of rapid appraisal (an entire day course)

Overall comments
Again the overall comments on the day were very positive, many of them praising the skill of the trainer. Some people did comment that they would have preferred to have papers/ documentation sent to them more in advance (10-15 days prior). Also there were a number of comments regarding the venue being too small making workshop activity difficulty. There were also a few technical problems with getting equipment on time for the start of the day.

HEALTHY CITIES
Belfast

Appendix 1 - Participant List

Training the Trainers Participants – 14 November 2005

City	Participant
Bologna	Michela Fantini
Bologna	Emanuela Pipitone
Brighton & Hove	Lydie Lawrence
Bursa	Kayihan Pala
Geneva	Jean Simos
Geneva	Nicola Cantoreggi
Geneva	Kurt Frei
Helingsborg	Elisabeth Bengtsson
Henlinsborg	Kerstin Mansson
Ljubljana	Dunja Obersnel Kveder
Turku	Heini Parkkunen

HIA Beginners Training 15 and 16 November 2005

City	Participant
Belgium – Liege	Roseline Van de Winckel
Belgium – Liege	Gabrielle Houbiers
Belgium - Liege	Jacqueline Trinon
Copenhagen	Helle Vinther Kristensen
Copenhagen	Nina Gath
Copenhagen	Marie Louise Bistrop
Newcastle upon Tyne	Doreen Huddart
Newcastle upon Tyne	Angela Wallace
Pecs	Antonio de Blasio
Pecs	Janos Giran
Seizal	Mirieme Ferreira
Seixal	Sandra Aguiar
Bologna	Michela Fantini
Bologna	Emanuela Pipitone
Brighton & Hove	Lydie Lawrence
Bursa	Kayihan Pala
Geneva	Jean Simos
Geneva	Nicola Cantoreggi
Geneva	Kurt Frei
Helingsborg	Elisabeth Bengtsson
Henlinsborg	Kerstin Mansson
Ljubljana	Dunja Obersnel Kveder
Turku	Heini Parkkunen

Course Facilitators
Erica Ison, Oxford University (trainer)
Ruth Fleming, Belfast Healthy Cities (chair – 15/16 Nov)
Claire Higgins, Institute of Public Health in Ireland (chair 14 Nov)

HEALTHY CITIES
Belfast

Appendix 2 – Programme for Train the Trainers HIA Programme

Training the Trainers
Monday 14 November 2005

Programme for Participants

08 45 Welcome and Introduction (Chair)
08 50 Expectations for the event in the context of the Sub-Network for HIA (Chair)
08 55 Learning objectives for the day (Chair)

Part 1: Introduction
09 05 Presentation about the Training Module in the HIA Toolkit (Trainer)
09 15 Exercise: What makes a good trainer? (Brainstorming led by trainer)
09 30 Discussion of participants' training needs (Trainer and participants)

Part 2: Presentation Skills and Knowledge of HIA
09 45 Presentation about the knowledge and experience needed to train people in HIA
(Trainer)
10 00 Exercise: what makes a good presenter? (Brainstorming led by trainer)
10 15 Exercise: Presentation Skills in HIA[1]
Each participant will give an 8-10 minute presentation about a particular aspect of HIA
e.g. "What is involved in screening". Participants may have to answer questions
about their talk. The trainer, supported by other participants, will give feedback on the
content and delivery of each presentation (see notes on page 2)

12 15 LUNCH

13 00 Introduction to the afternoon session (Chair)

Part 3: Facilitation Skills and Supporting People in their Learning about HIA
13 05 Presentation about the potential sources of frustration and difficulties people
commonly experience when learning about or doing HIA (Trainer)
13 20 Exercise: identifying the frustrations and difficulties you or your organisation has
experienced when introducing and/or undertaking HIA (Work in pairs led by trainer)
13 40 Exercise: what makes a good facilitator? (Brainstorming led by trainer)
13 55 Interactive Presentation about the application of facilitation skills in HIA (Trainer, with
opportunities for participants to contribute)
14 15 Presentation about other skills required to undertake HIA (Trainer)
14 30 Break for coffee/tea

---

[1] There will be no break for drinks but participants will have a 5-minute break to get tea/coffee and drink it while listening
to presentations/giving feedback

HEALTHY CITIES
Belfast

15 00 Exercise: identifying training and skills development needs, and ways of meeting them, for different groups of people in your organisation (Work in small groups led by trainer)

15 30 Exercise: identifying ways of complementing and supporting training in your organisation (Brainstorming led by trainer)

15 45 Personal Reflection, including brief presentation, and discussion about the importance of reflective practice, especially for trainers (Trainer, with opportunities for participants to contribute)

16 15 Allocation and discussion of tasks for trainee trainers on the Beginners Course

16 25 Closing remarks (Chair)

Sub-network meeting
16 30 to 17 30   Sub-network meeting for sub-network members only (see separate agenda

Preparation for the Course

Preparation for Part 1
Each participant needs:
- Ø to identify and submit their learning needs before they come on the course. (**please send these to Maura Ahern by Thursday 10 November** (maura@belfasthealthycities.com)

Preparation for Part 2
Each participant needs:
- Ø to prepare an 8-10 minute presentation, which can be supported by using Powerpoint or an overhead projector, and/or a flipchart.

Participants should select a subject from the following list and notify the trainer before they come on the course which subject they have selected (erica_ison@yahoo.co.uk).
(participants should also select a 2nd choice in order to avoid too much overlap among presenters):
- o Screening in HIA;
- o Scoping in HIA;
- o Appraisal in HIA;
- o Working with decision-makers in HIA;
- o Monitoring and evaluation in HIA;
- o The values and characteristics of HIA and what they mean in practice;
- o Methods of stakeholder consultation in HIA;
- o HIA in relation to other forms of impact assessment (EIA, SEA, SIA, economic IA, etc.);
- o Models of health, models of HIA, and the determinants of health;
- o Reporting the results of HIA to stakeholders.

NB: The presentation should NOT be a case-study. Participants should pretend they are training beginners on one element/stage of HIA and therefore outline what this element/stage involves.

HEALTHY CITIES
Belfast

Preparation for Day 1 of the Beginner's Course

Each participant needs:

- Ø to prepare a 5-minute presentation covering tips or learning points about HIA that you think it would be helpful to pass on to beginners, which can be supported by using Powerpoint or an overhead projector, and/or a flipchart.

If you have not done any HIA before, then prepare a 5-minute presentation covering tips or learning points about HIA that you have identified from other people's HIA work. Contact Erica if you need a website address to help you find HIA case-study(ies) to do this (erica_ison@yahoo.co.uk).

All participants need to be prepared to take one or two questions on their short presentation (~5 minutes).

Resources needed for the Course

Each participant will be required to bring to the course:

- a notebook or journal to record notes, the results of any exercises, and reflections on the process of training, and/or the training course;
- the products from the WHO/EU PHASE Project, available on the Healthy Cities website (www.euro.who.int/healthy-cities). When you go into this website click on the menu item WHO/European commission Phase Project and then click on the HIA toolkit for cities.

Learning Objectives for this course
combined with providing support on the Beginners Course[2]

- ∨ To give participants an understanding of how to use the Training Module in the HIA Toolkit to provide training in HIA in their Healthy Cities
- ∨ To inform participants of the knowledge and experience it is advisable for them to acquire and develop in order to train people in HIA
- ∨ To give participants an appreciation of the difficulties people usually experience when learning about, and undertaking, HIA
- ∨ To give participants an opportunity to review and develop their presentation skills in relation to training people in HIA, including giving a presentation to their fellow participants, and the opportunity to give a brief presentation to the participants on Day 1 of the Beginners Course
- ∨ To give participants an opportunity to take a brief question-and-answer session with the participants on Day 1 of the Beginners Course
- ∨ To give participants an opportunity to review and develop their facilitation skills in relation to training people in HIA, including the opportunity to facilitate a small group during a rapid appraisal workshop on Day 2 of the Beginners Course
- ∨ To highlight the skills needed to undertake HIA, and explore ways to meet training needs for different groups in a WHO Healthy City
- ∨ To explore ways of supporting and complementing any training in HIA given in a WHO Healthy City
- ∨ To explore the benefits of reflective practice for trainers
- ∨ To give participants an opportunity to practise their HIA training skills by working with participants on the Beginners Course in HIA (Days 1 & 2 of the Beginners Course)

---

[2] It is acknowledged that not all of the participants on the Training the Trainers Course can be present for both days of the Beginners Course.

HEALTHY CITIES
Belfast

∨ To explore ways of working with, and involving, politicians and other decision-makers in the process of HIA (Day 2 of the Beginners Course)
∨ To explore ways of introducing and mainstreaming HIA into participants' Healthy Cities (Day 2 of the Beginners Course)
∨ To give participants an opportunity to learn from the HIA experience of people from other Healthy Cities (Day 1 of the Beginners Course)

Programme devised by Erica Ison

HEALTHY CITIES
Belfast

Appendix 3 – Programme for Beginners Programme

**WHO Healthy Cities Sub-Network in HIA:
Training in HIA, November 2005, Paris**

**HIA for Beginners
15-16 November 2005**

Programme for Participants

DAY 1

09 00 Welcome and Introduction (Chair)
09 05   Expectations for the event within the context of the Sub-Network in HIA (Chair)
09 10 Learning objectives for the course (Chair)

Part 1: Introduction
09 20 Overview of the concept and process of HIA, to include a discussion of participants'
pre-course work (Main trainer)

Part 2: Screening
10 00 Presentation about screening and its importance in HIA (Main trainer)
10 15 Exercise: screening (participants work in small groups supported by trainee trainers,
and main trainer if necessary)

11 00 BREAK FOR COFFEE/TEA

Part 3: Scoping
11 30 Presentation about scoping and its importance in HIA (Main trainer)
11 45 Exercise: screening (participants work in small groups supported by trainee trainers,
and main trainer if necessary)

12 30 LUNCH

Part 4: Appraisal, and possibilities for stakeholder involvement
13 30 Presentation about appraisal as the pivotal stage in HIA (Main trainer)
14 15 Exercise: understanding the various tasks that comprise appraisal (participants work
in small groups supported by trainee trainers, and main trainer if necessary)

15 00 BREAK FOR COFFEE/TEA

15 30 Presentation about reporting the results of HIA (Main trainer)
16 00 Exercise: reporting the results of HIA (participants work in small groups supported by
trainee trainers, and main trainer if necessary)
16 30 Hot Tips: brief presentations, and question-and-answer sessions, from trainee
trainers, and main trainer covering practical advice on undertaking HIA
17 30 Closing remarks (Chair)

Programme for Participants **continued**

DAY 2

09 00 Welcome (Chair)

Part 5: Working with politicians and other decision-makers
09 10 Presentation about how HIA can support politicians and decision-makers (Main trainer)
09 40 Exercise: ways of involving politicians and decision-makers in HIA (participants work in small groups supported by trainee trainers, and main trainer if necessary)
10 10 Discussion: difficulties that can be experienced while working with politicians and decision-makers (all participants – beginners and trainee trainers – led by main trainer)

Part 6: Monitoring and evaluation
10 30 Presentation about monitoring and evaluation and its importance in HIA (Main trainer)[3]
11 00 Exercise: process evaluation in HIA (participants work in small groups supported by trainee trainers, and main trainer if necessary)

Part 7: Introducing and mainstreaming HIA in your organisation
11 30 Presentation about ways of introducing HIA into your organisation (Main trainer)
12 00 Exercise: preparation for and mainstreaming HIA into your organisation (all participants – beginners and trainee trainers – led by main trainer)

12 30 LUNCH

Part 8: Experiencing a rapid appraisal workshop[4]
13 30 Rapid appraisal of a proposal
Participants will conduct a rapid appraisal of a proposal. The trainee trainers will facilitate the small work groups during the rapid appraisal. The main trainer will act as the overall facilitator for the rapid appraisal.

16 00 CLOSE

---

[3] Coffee/Tea will be available to drink during presentation.

[4] There will be no official break for coffee/tea but participants can take refreshment while they are working.

Programme for Participants **continued**

Preparation for the Course

General
Each participant needs:
- Ø to identify and submit their learning needs before they come on the course (**please send these to Maura Ahern by Thursday 10 November** (maura@belfasthealthycities.com)

Preparation for Part 1
Each participant needs:
- Ø to do all the tasks in Exercise 1 of the Training Module (part of the HIA Toolkit on the WHO Healthy Cities website (www.euro.who.int/healthy-cities). When you go into this website click on the menu item WHO/European commission Phase Project and then click on the HIA toolkit for cities.

Resources needed for the Course
Each participant will be required to bring to the course:
- a notebook or journal to record notes, the results of any exercises, and reflections on the process of training, and/or the training course;
- the products from the WHO/EU PHASE Project, available on the WHO Healthy Cities website (see above)

Learning Objectives for this Course
- ∨ To give participants an understanding of the concept of HIA, its values and characteristics
- ∨ To give participants knowledge about the process of HIA, and what is involved at each stage
- ∨ To explore criteria that could be used when screening proposals for HIA in participants' Healthy Cities
- ∨ To give participants experience of scoping at a basic level in HIA
- ∨ To give participants an understanding of the tasks necessary to undertake appraisal in HIA
- ∨ To explore ways of working with, and involving, politicians and other decision-makers in the process of HIA
- ∨ To help participants develop criteria for the process evaluation of any HIAs they undertake in their city
- ∨ To explore ways of introducing and mainstreaming HIA into participants' Healthy Cities
- ∨ To give participants an opportunity to take part in a rapid appraisal workshop and gain experience in this technique
- ∨ To give participants an opportunity to learn from the HIA experience of people from other Healthy Cities

Programme devised by Erica Ison

Health Impact Assessment (HIA) Training the Trainers Results
(9 forms returned)

Presentations given by the trainer
Q. How useful did you find the presentations given by the trainer on the following topics?

Training module in the HIA toolkit

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**4**	**5**	**0**	**0**	**0**	
%	**44.4%**	**55.6%**	**0**	**0**	**0**	

Frustrations/Difficulties people commonly experience when learning about/doing HIA

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**2**	**6**	**1**	**0**	**0**	
%	**22.2%**	**66.7%**	**11.1%**	**0**	**0**	

Knowledge and experience needed to train people in HIA

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**2**	**7**	**0**	**0**	**0**	
%	**22.2%**	**77.8%**	**0**	**0**	**0**	

Skills required to undertake HIA

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**2**	**6**	**1**	**0**	**0**	
%	**22.2%**	**66.7%**	**11.1%**	**0**	**0**	

Workshop Exercises
Q. How useful did you find the workshop exercises?

What makes a good trainer?

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**1**	**6**	**2**	**0**	**0**	
%	**11.1%**	**66.7%**	**22.2%**	**0**	**0**	

Presentation skills/Skills in giving feedback

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**3**	**5**	**1**	**0**	**0**	
%	**33.3%**	**55.6%**	**11.1%**	**0**	**0**	

Identifying frustrations/difficulties experienced when working on HIA

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**2**	**5**	**0**	**0**	**0**	
%	**22.2%**	**55.6%**	**0**	**0**	**0**	

(2 did not answer this question)

Identifying training and skills development needs for different groups in your organisation

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**0**	**8**	**1**	**0**	**0**	
%	**0**	**88.9%**	**11.1%**	**0**	**0**	

Handouts

Q. How useful did you find the handouts provide by the trainer?

Presentation skills

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**3**	**4**	**2**	**0**	**0**	
%	**33.3%**	**44.5%**	**22.2%**	**0**	**0**	

Facilitation skills – text handout

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**4**	**4**	**1**	**0**	**0**	
%	**44.5%**	**44.5%**	**11%**	**0**	**0**	

Frustrations/difficulties people experience when working on HIA

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**3**	**5**	**1**	**0**	**0**	
%	**33.3%**	**55.6%**	**11.1%**	**0**	**0**	

Application of facilitation skills in HIA – Powerpoint handout

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**3**	**4**	**2**	**0**	**0**	
%	**33.3%**	**44.5%**	**22.2%**	**0**	**0**	

Other skills required to undertake HIA

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**1**	**6**	**2**	**0**	**0**	
%	**11.1**	**66.7%**	**22.2%**	**0**	**0**	

Reflective Practice

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**2**	**5**	**2**	**0**	**0**	
%	**22.2%**	**55.6%**	**22.2%**	**0**	**0**	

Facilitation skills case studies

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**3**	**3**	**3**	**0**	**0**	
%	**33.3%**	**33.3%**	**33.3%**	**0**	**0**	

Listening Skills

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**1**	**6**	**2**	**0**	**0**	
%	**11.1%**	**66.7%**	**22.2%**	**0**	**0**	

HEALTHY CITIES
Belfast

Q. Have you trained or helped to train people in HIA before coming on this course?
Yes = 3 (33.3%)
No = 6 (66.7%)

If the answer is No:

Q. Would you feel confident about training people in HIA having participated in the Training the Trainers course?

Yes = 5 (71.4%)
No = 2 (28.6%)

Q. What was your level of understanding of HIA **prior to** the training?

high level of understanding	5	4	3	2	1	no understanding
Number	**0**	**4**	**5**	**0**	**0**	
%	**0**	**44.4%**	**55.6%**	**0**	**0**	

Q. What is your level of understanding of HIA **after** the training?

high level of understanding	5	4	3	2	1	no understanding
Number	**4**	**5**	**0**	**0**	**0**	
%	**44.4%**	**55.6%**	**0**	**0**	**0**	

Q. Have you completed or supported someone to complete an HIA in the past?
Yes = 7 (77.8%)
No = 2 (22.2%)

If the answer is No:

Q. Would you feel confident now after participating in the training to complete or support someone to complete an HIA in the future?
Yes = 5 (55.6%)

Q. Would you require additional support to do this?
Yes = 6 (66.7%)
No = 2 (22.2%)

If the answer is Yes:

What additional support would you require?

- Someone available to help evaluate draft HIA reports and be available to answer questions on HIA when difficulties arise
- More time with a trainer
- A further one day advanced train the trainer course
- More time (3 days training course for trainers would be more adequate than only one)

HEALTHY CITIES
Belfast

- Support with teaching people how to do a HIA and why, i.e. advantages versus difficulties and how to manage the difficulties
- Developing specific tools and indicators, finding evidence, stakeholder consultation (appropriate model, skills)
- Experiences from others, sharing and learning from cities

Q. Highlight 3 things that you learnt on this course:

All responses are included:
- Presentation and facilitation skills are very important for an HIA training course
- If you show adequate evidence it is possible to effect the decision makers and you can provide appropriate evidence by way of HIA
- It is very important to hear participants experiences of HIA and their experience of working with politicians
- To understand who are the real stakeholders
- To support people
- Enhanced skills to work with politicians and engage them in the process throughout
- Negotiations and facilitation skills
- Reminded of the importance of governance and accountability
- Key aspects of reporting results, report writing and making recommendations = 'consider' recommendations
- Improvement of presentation skills
- Some important methodological issues regarding HIA processes and approaches
- Important issues on decision-making process
- More aware of the positive aspect of HIA and differences between HIA and EIA
- Basic differences between HIA and Health needs assessment or Health technical assessment
- Don't make suggestions/recommendations before identifying all health impacts
- To undertake an appraisal
- Greater understanding of who should be the stakeholders
- The full HIA process is much longer and wider than I have experienced before
- We are all beginners
- Not to be afraid of starting a full HIA process – others have done it and succeeded
- Presentation skills/attitude
- Basic skills to develop own tools (screening and scoping criteria)
- Basic skills on how to introduce people to HIA and how to run basic exercises
- Many cities have done various things, there is a lot to learn from
- The more you hear of HIA, the more complicated it sounds

Q. Please specify any future training needs you may have
- To observe the application of an HIA especially performing evaluation with stakeholders
- To teach people and to convince them
- A one day advanced train the trainer course – mainly on training skills, presenting HIA in a simple, practical and effective manner
- Specific training for step 3 'Appraisal'
- Don't know yet. We need to get some practical experiences before we can identify the next training needs
- Specific tools and indicator development
- Evidence finding and producing: stakeholder consultation (appropriate models, skills)

HEALTHY CITIES
Belfast

- Integration of sustainable development, health promotion and HIA as tools and methods
- How to create confidence doing HIA and presenting it at a local level.

Overall comments on the course:

- It was very effective course for me. Thanks a lot to everyone
- It would have been better to receive documents at least 2 weeks before the training to have enough time to understand and read them
- Excellent and inspiring. Erica worked very hard to keep the course structured, interesting and challenging. The use of English language was an issue for some of the member cities, which in addition to learning about a new subject (HIA) made it difficult for some to participate fully
- An excellent trainer! Good opportunity to share other experiences with other participants
- Erica Ison made a very good job in Paris, she must be congratulated!
- Good! Erica is an excellent trainer with lots of enthusiasm.
- Very useful and supportive. Needs to be better prepared in advance regarding programme – providing documents and handouts, logistics.
- Small group so possible to discuss. The cities in the sub-network are heterogeneous – some with experience, others not so much. The role of the sub-network and individual cities – how much are they expected to train others?

Health Impact Assessment (HIA) for Beginners
Results (10 forms returned)

Presentations given by the trainer
Q. How useful did you find the presentations aspects of HIA? Please circle the appropriate number.

Overview of HIA

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**2**	**8**	**0**	**0**	**0**	
%	**20%**	**80%**	**0**	**0**	**0**	

Screening

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**0**	**8**	**1**	**0**	**0**	
%	**0**	**80%**	**10%**	**0**	**0**	

(1 did not answer this question)

Scoping

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**1**	**7**	**1**	**0**	**0**	
%	**10%**	**70%**	**10%**	**0**	**0**	

(1 did not answer this question)

Appraisal

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**3**	**6**	**0**	**0**	**0**	
%	**30%**	**60%**	**0**	**0**	**0**	

(1 did not answer this question)

Reporting the results of HIA

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**2**	**7**	**0**	**1**	**0**	
%	**20%**	**70%**	**0**	**10%**		

Working with politicians

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**1**	**9**	**0**	**0**	**0**	
%	**10%**	**90%**	**0**	**0**	**0**	

Monitoring and evaluation

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**1**	**6**	**3**	**0**	**0**	
%	**10%**	**60%**	**30%**	**0**	**0**	

Introducing and mainstreaming HIA

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**0**	**6**	**3**	**0**	**0**	
%	**0**	**60%**	**30%**	**0**	**0**	

(1 did not answer this question)

Workshop Exercises

Q. How useful did you find the workshop exercises on the following aspects of HIA? Please circle the appropriate number.

Screening

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**0**	**6**	**3**	**0**	**0**	
%	**0**	**60%**	**30%**	**0**	**0**	

(1 did not answer this question)

Appraisal

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**0**	**5**	**2**	**0**	**0**	
%	**0**	**50%**	**20%**			

(3 did not answer this question)

Reporting the results of HIA

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**0**	**6**	**1**	**0**	**1**	
%	**0**	**60%**	**10%**	**0**	**10%**	

(2 did not answer this question)

Working with politicians

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**1**	**7**	**1**	**0**	**0**	
%	**10%**	**70%**	**10%**	**0**	**0**	

(1 did not answer this question)

Monitoring and evaluation (Process evaluation)

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**0**	**7**	**1**	**1**	**0**	
%	**0**	**70%**	**10%**	**10%**	**0**	

(1 did not answer this question)

What do you need to do HIA?

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**0**	**5**	**2**	**0**	**0**	
%	**0**	**50%**	**20%**			

(3 did not answer this question)

Introducing and mainstreaming HIA

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**0**	**4**	**3**	**0**	**0**	
%	**0**	**40%**	**30%**	**0**	**0**	

(3 did not answer this question)

HEALTHY CITIES
Belfast

Rapid Appraisal Workshop

Useful	5	4	3	2	1	Not at all Useful
Number	**3**	**3**	**2**	**0**	**0**	
%	**30%**	**30%**	**20%**	**0**	**0**	

(2 did not answer this question)

Q. What was your level of understanding about what is involved in completing an HIA **before** attending the training course?

high level of understanding	5	4	3	2	1	no understanding
Number	**0**	**3**	**4**	**2**	**0**	
%	**0**	**30%**	**40%**	**20%**	**0**	

(1 did not answer this question)

Q. What is your level of understanding about what is involved in completing an HIA **after** participating in this training course?

high level of understanding	5	4	3	2	1	no understanding
Number	**1**	**6**	**2**	**0**	**0**	
%	**10%**	**60%**	**20%**	**0**	**0**	

(1 did not answer this question)

Q. Would you feel confident about undertaking an HIA in the future?
Yes = 5 (55.6%)
No = 4 (44.4%)

Q. What support would you need to help you carry out an HIA?

- We feel we would need guidance from experienced people who have already conducted small scale HIA
- Someone available to help evaluate draft HIA reports and be available to answer questions on HIA when difficulties arise
- Support in being a facilitator during the process of doing a HIA
- Examples of standard documents: methodology document, scoping document etc
- A HIA database which facilitate (when looking for quick information) the execution of a HIA. The current HIA database available (i.e. HIA Gateway) simply listed the completed HIA reports. A more useful database should organise the information in order to allow cross search through items, key words etc
- Support with teaching people how to do a HIA and why, i.e. advantages versus difficulties and how to manage the last ones
- Support from management and from partners involved, plus enough time to do the job
- Technical advisory and consultancy from WHO to the development of initial HIAs and HIAs involving greater complexity

HEALTHY CITIES
Belfast

Highlight 3 things that you learnt on this training course:

Everyone's responses:
- We have learnt the existence of specific tools that would help conduct HIA e.g. screening tools
- The training has also confirmed our understanding of the importance of gaining support from politicians in this type of study and process
- To make sure that the HIA that will be performed is well defined and scoped so that there is a balance between the budget and means that can be allocated to the study and the scope of the project
- 28 people are too many for a HIA course. The first days training (train the trainer) was more effective than the other days for me
- Appraisal is a very important stage of the HIA process
- Some participants don't observe ground rules (e.g. not turning off mobile phones) even in Europe
- Rapid appraisal – learnt how it works in practice
- Ideas on how to involve the politicians and what is important for the politicians to know (alternatives to the proposal, economics)
- The course gave a good understanding of the definition of terms used in the HIA methodology
- Useful tips on different stages of HIA
- Differences between HIA theory and practice
- How to develop a pragmatic approach of HIA
- To report on HIA results
- How to lead a discussion for a rapid appraisal
- To distinguish HIA phases/stages
- To be careful about not identifying recommendations in order to avoid legal responsibly
- To avoid making corrections or additions to a proposal instead of doing the actual appraisal
- The use of having HIA, not only in projects still being developed, but also in projects already developed and in future actions
- That there are different stages of complexity in HIA, which can be useful, according to the function of the project/programme to be assessed
- Useful strategies to support the political decision in the most varied issues, applying HIA as a resource

Please specify any future training needs you may have:

- We would be grateful if we could attend training organised in French for example by the collaborative centre S2D
- It would be useful if we could have a personal trainer/guide: someone we could contact regularly when we have questions and who could advise us on the different steps to take to run the HIA
- More case studies/examples in the exercises. Ideas/methods on how to facilitate an HIA especially appraisal
- Focus on a more extensive exercise of rapid appraisal (an entire day course)
- HIA updating/upgrading sessions. Training in more advanced levels with greater demand

Overall comments on the course:

- Warm welcome, friendly, pleasant working environment
- It was an effective course for me, thank you. I would like to thank Erica, Ruth and Annette. But I have to say the training atmosphere was not so good. This was due to physical problems such as the room being too small; difficulty in seeing the presentation and flip charts due to the size of the room. There was no daylight and fresh air in the room and there wasn't enough space for exercise groups resulting in a lot of noise which affected hearing.
- Received documents quite late.
- The rapid appraisal exercise was very good. There should be more exercises like that – where you have a case to work on. It is only when working on a concrete case that you really understand the process.
- Erica is a really good teacher and facilitator
- An excellent trainer! Good opportunity to share experiences with other participants
- I'd prefer to have the documents more in advance, at least 10-15 days before the training, the same when we are asked to prepare documents
- The HIA course was good, but it did not relate (much or at all) to the Healthy cities project, such as including the healthy cities indicators as a potentially important factor.
- I have considered this course to be extremely useful, in pedagogic contents presented, as well as by the exchange of experiences between cities standing in different stages of the HIA implementation of this process.